

**ASSESSMENT OF LEADING LOCATIONS AGAINST CRITERIA**

<i>Location</i>	<b>Edinburgh Castle Crown Room</b>	<b>St Giles Cathedral, Edinburgh</b>	<b>Museum of Scotland, Edinburgh</b>	<b>Scone</b>	<b>Chapel Royal Stirling</b>
<i>Criterion</i>					
<b>Links with historic past</b>	Yes, strong Royal links; Crown Room built by James VI to house Honours of Scotland	No, except insofar as St Giles also has long history	No, though related artefacts also housed in Museum	Yes, specific links with the Stone; but little remains of original surroundings	Yes in that last 3 Coronations prior to 1603 held in Stirling.
<b>Support and enhance solemn and historic significance</b>	Yes - very strongly enhanced by presence of Honours of Scotland	Yes	Can be associated with important and contemporary treasures but would depend on character of display	Unknown, would depend on character of building provided	Yes, but only if no longer used for secular purposes
<b>Free of incongruous features</b>	Yes	Yes	Cannot be wholly guaranteed	Depends on character of building provided	Yes (see above)
<b>Stringent security</b>	Yes	Would need to be enhanced	Yes	Depends on character of building provided	May need enhancement
<b>Acceptable ambient conditions</b>	Yes	Yes, depending on exact location in Cathedral	Yes	Depends on character of building provided	Yes

**ABLE**

<i>Location</i>	<b>Edinburgh Castle Crown Room</b>	<b>St Giles Cathedral, Edinburgh</b>	<b>Museum of Scotland, Edinburgh</b>	<b>Scone</b>	<b>Chapel Royal Stirling</b>
<b>Accessible to public/open all year round</b>	Yes - charge made, but free access can be arranged 2 x year	Yes, no charge. Access could be restricted during services	Yes - no charge	Charge likely but would be a matter for Trustees.	Yes but charge would be made
<b>Accommodate high level of visitors without strain</b>	Yes	Yes	Yes	Depends on character of building provided	Yes
<b>Be capable of offering high quality interpretative material</b>	Yes	With assistance, yes, but depends on wishes of congregation	Yes	Depends on expertise of providers	Yes
<b>Religious building</b>	No	Yes	No	No	Yes but not active <u>place of worship</u>

**POINTS NOT SUBJECT TO CONSULTATION**

<b>Close links with Crown</b>	Yes	Church property; but already responsible for Thistle Chapel	S of S appointed Trustees	No, Private Trust	Yes
<b>Available now</b>	Yes	Probably, although some preparation required	Apparently not; Stone would go on tour first	No, could take some time to build	Yes

PRINCIPAL LOCATIONS BY STATUS OF RESPONDENTS COMMENTING

	<i>Supporters</i>	Politicians	Local authorities/public bodies	Churchmen	Academics	Other public figures/bodies	Other
<i>Location</i>							
Edinburgh Castle Crown Room							
Yes		Norman Hogg MP Sir Hector Monro MP Alistair Darling MP	Historic Scotland Lord Provost of Edinburgh	Action of Churches Together Methodist Church in Scotland Primus of Scottish Episcopal Church	Professor Keith M Brown	Business and Professional Women, Grangemouth The Lord Borthwick Lord Justice Clerk The Earl of Elgin and Kincardine Lothian and Borders Police Lord Lyon	K C Fraser W McLelland Mrs E S Batting Michael Clancy Mrs A Grant
No					Professor Alan Macinnes David H Sellar (Dept of Private Law, EU) Professor Michael Lynch (Dept of Scottish History, EU)		Mr and Mrs J Haddow

lorfe)  
**Prin pa**

he

he Chiape

oya

<i>Supporters</i>	Politicians	Local authorities/public bodies	Churchmen	Academics	Other public figures/bodies	Other
<b>St Giles Cathedral</b>						
<b>Yes</b>	Sir Patrick Cormack MP Alistair Darling MP		Moderator of C of S Methodist Church in Scotland Dean of the Chapel Royal The V Rev Gilleasbuig Macmillan Free Church of Scotland		Earl of Lauderdale Lothian and Borders Police Ross Herald of Arms Lord Belhaven and Stenton	Mr and Mrs J D Lunsden B R Cargill K W Lorraine
<b>No</b>	Norman Hogg MP Sir Hector Monro MP			Professor Barrow David H Sellar (Dept of Private Law EU) Professor Michael Lynch (Dept of Scottish History, EU)	Lord Justice Clerk Sir William Fraser	
<b>Maybe</b>	[Sir Michael Neibert]		Action of Churches Together Principal Clerk to the General Assembly of the C of S Primus of Scottish Episcopal Church [Dean of Westminster Abbey]	Christopher Whateley Dept of Modern History, University of Dundee		

<i>Supporters</i>	<b>Politicians</b>	<b>Local authorities/public bodies</b>	<b>Churchmen</b>	<b>Academics</b>	<b>Other public figures/bodies</b>	<b>Other</b>
<b>Museum of Scotland</b> Yes		Society of Antiquaries of Scotland National Museums of Scotland		Historiographer Royal of Scotland (Prof Smout) Professor Michael Lynch (Dept of Scottish History, EU)		Mrs Alison MacLachlan
No					Lord Lyon	
Maybe			Action of Churches Together	David H Sellar (Dept of Private Law EU)		

ish erp

'ent'

Ch  
pher  
ley ep  
ode ony

Th

idee

ion:

Ch  
scotland

ether

nd  
De  
yari

Loi